

Avalikult Rail Balticust

MTÜ ARB

Mardi talu, Pirgu küla, Juuru vald
79401 Raplamaa
ESTONIA
toimkond@avalikultrailbalticust.ee

Mr Kaspars Briškens,
RB Rail AS
K. Valdemāra iela 8,
Riga, Latvia, LV-1010

CC: Anti Moppel, Indrek Orav, Kaspars Rokens, Karmo Korvek, Nauris Kļava, Jānis Strautmanis, Jānis Veide, Ene-Margit Tiit, Roland Uuesoo, Ministry of Economic Affairs and Communications of Estonia, Ministry of Transport of Latvia, Ministry of Transport and Communications of Lithuania

Re: Issues regarding Rail Baltica CBA

Your ref. 6.1/2017-479
Our: 15.09.2017

Dear participants of the meeting between MTÜ ARB and RB Rail AS held in September 18, 2017

Please find our confirmed agenda (enclosed). We would like to remind you that the reason for this meeting is our study "Major mistakes in Rail Baltic CBA made by EY" (<http://avalikultrailbalticust.ee/PDF/RB%20EY%20errors.pdf>). We were invited by RB Rail AS in September 4th, 2017 to the meeting "... to provide feedback to the claims made by your organization with regard to the Rail Baltica Global Project Cost Benefit Analysis". So, we are glad to attend the meeting so that claims arisen from this study will be discussed thoroughly as per enclosed agenda and per our letters. Please note that we do not accept the situation in the meeting when these topics will not be handled due to lack of meeting time or to other reasons.

Please consider that answers of RB Rail AS are important not only to us personally, but to taxpayers in the Baltic states and the European Union. Since now RB Rail AS has refused answer to our questions in writing. We want to avoid bias interpretation of your comments and we will record and make public your answers to these questions as we stated in the previous e-mail from 07.09.2017. According to reply from INEA and also from Ministry of Economic Affairs and Communications of Estonia answers to our questions should be provided by the staff of RB Rail AS. Any third party or quests of RB Rail AS who might avoid recording as was indicated in RB Rail AS letter from September 14, 2017, may omit this part of the meeting and join after recording is finished.

If you prefer to answer us in writing instead of meeting recording we most welcome this kind of development and will not take your valuable time on coming Monday. Written answer shall be a solid and acceptable communication form for all parties involved.

Please note that documents cited in CBA have not been made public yet. We added a topic to the agenda about deadline when following documents will be made publicly available to the meeting.

- 1) All written communication you have had with EY regarding CBA issues we have disclosed.
- 2) Any written reply you have provided regarding these issues to European Commission or to relevant ministries of the Baltic states.

Following unpublicised documents referenced in CBA

- 3) National Study RB, 2016 (Ref 10)
- 4) Unspecified document EY, (Ref 12)
- 5) Study ordered by Finnish Transport Agency in 2014 (Ref in page 89)
- 6) Freight Flow Forecasting from Arctic Sea Route and Adriatic Route to Rail Baltica Railway Line. Jüri Sakkeus, Aado Keskaik, Erik Terk (Ref 99)
- 7) EY benchmarking study of existing freight carriers in Finland, Netherlands, Czech Republic, Germany and Poland (Ref 138)
- 8) Information provided by RBR (Ref 174 and 175)
- 9) Detailed CAPEX estimation (Ref in page 145)
- 10) Atkins "Cost Estimation, Renewal & Maintenance and Benchmarking" (2017) report

Please find enclosed confirmed agenda.

We announce following participants to the meeting:

Priit Humal, Member of the Board, MTU ARB
Karli Lambot, MTU ARB
Illimar Paul, MTU ARB
Prof Ene-Margit Tiit, University of Tartu, Statistics Estonia
Roland Uuesoo, Ökoriik Estonia

With best regards

Priit Humal
member of the board

Karli Lambot

Illimar Paul

Raul Vibo

Attached:

Agenda of the meeting 18.09.17

Letter of RB Rail AS from September 14, 2017

Letter of MTÜ ARB from September 7, 2017

Letter of RB Rail AS from September 4, 2017

Letter of MTÜ ARB from July 31, 2017

Major mistakes in Rail Baltic CBA made by EY